Response of multiple herbicide resistant strain of diazotrophic cyanobacterium, Anabaena variabilis, exposed to atrazine and DCMU

Surendra Singh, Pallavi Datta^{*} & Archna Tirkey

Algal Biotechnology Laboratory, Department of Biological Sciences, Rani Durgavati University, Jabalpur 482 001, India

Received 1 June 2010; revised 24 January 2011

Effect of two photosynthetic inhibitor herbicides, atrazine (both purified and formulated) and [3-(3,4-dichlorophenyl)-1,1-dimethyl urea] (DCMU), on the growth, macromolecular contents, heterocyst frequency, photosynthetic O_2 evolution and dark O_2 uptake of wild type and multiple herbicide resistant (MHR) strain of diazotrophic cyanobacterium *A. variabilis* was studied. Cyanobacterial strains showed gradual inhibition in growth with increasing dosage of herbicides. Both wild type and MHR strain tolerated < 6.0 mg L⁻¹ of atrazine (purified), < 2.0 mg L⁻¹ of atrazine (formulated) and < 0.4 mg L⁻¹ of DCMU indicating similar level of herbicide tolerance. Atrazine (pure) (8.0 mg L⁻¹) and 4.0 mg L⁻¹ of atrazine (formulated) were growth inhibitory concentrations (lethal) for both wild type and MHR strain indicating formulated atrazine was more toxic than the purified form. Comparatively lower concentrations of DCMU were found to be lethal for wild type and MHR strain, respectively. Thus, between the two herbicides tested DCMU was more growth toxic than atrazine. At sublethal dosages of herbicides, photosynthetic O_2 evolution showed highest inhibition followed by chlorophyll *a*, phycobhiliproteins and heterocyst differentiation as compared to carotenoid, protein and respiratory O_2 uptake.

Keywords: Atrazine, Cyanobacteria, DCMU, Herbicides, Mutants, Photosynthesis

In modern agriculture weed control by herbicides is a common practice to increase in crop productivity¹. Continuous applications of herbicides are not only detrimental to undesired weeds, but also to the beneficial microbial flora of soil including cyanobacteria²⁻⁶. Cyanobacteria or blue green algae are a remarkable group of gram negative, oxygenic, photosynthetic, prokaryotes that grow and multiply at the simple expense of water, light and air⁷. Cyanobacteria have been shown to be agriculturally important as biofertilizer, particularly in tropical rice field soils, because of the capacity of some of these to synthesize organic substances and also to fix nitrogen⁸⁻¹⁰. The similarity atmospheric of cyanobacteria to the higher plants and eukaryotic algae in terms of photoautotrophic mode of nutrition invites similar growth inhibitory actions of photosynthetic inhibitor herbicides that are among the most widespread herbicides used¹¹. Successful exploitation of diazotrophic cyanobacteria as biofertilizer requires them to have capability to either

*Correspondent author Telephone: +91- 9300126788 Fax: 0761-2603752 E-mail: pallavidatta21@yahoo.com tolerate or resist toxic actions of various rice field herbicides. Much attention has not been paid in developing resistant strains of diazotrophic cyanobacteria capable of sustaining the detrimental impacts of herbicides ¹²⁻¹⁴.

Efforts were made to isolate a spontaneous mutant nitrogen fixing cyanobacterium Anabaena of variabilis a local rice field isolate¹⁵, exhibiting resistance to four commonly used rice field herbicides viz. arozin, alachlor, butachlor and 2,4-D; the mutant was designated as Av (MHR)¹⁶. In the present study investigations have been made to examine the biological responses under graded concentration photosynthetic inhibitor, of two rice field herbicides atrazine (both purified and formulated) and 3-(3,4-dichlorophenyl)-1,1-dimethyl urea (DCMU) with an aim to further incorporate atrazine and DCMU resistant traits. Both wild type and mutant strain showed similar level of tolerance towards these herbicides. DCMU was found to be more growth toxic as compared to Atrazine. Thus, the possibility of constructing multiple herbicide resistant strain of diazotrophic cyanobacterium tolerating six common rice field herbicides would serve as gene bank for further biotechnological studies and would prove beneficial in rice agriculture.

Materials and Methods

Organism and growth conditions—The axenic clonal culture of wild type N₂-fixing cyanobacterium Anabaena variabilis, a rice field isolate¹⁵, its spontaneous mutant [Av (MHR)] exhibiting resistance to the lethal dosages of arozin, alachlor, butachlor and 2,4-D^{5,16} was cultivated in BG₁₁ medium¹⁷ devoid of any combined nitrogen source (N₂-medium). Culture was incubated in an air-conditioned culture room maintained at 25°±1°C fitted with cool day fluorescent light. Photon flux density of light on the surface of the vessel was 45 µEm⁻² s⁻¹ for 18 h/day.

Herbicides—Atrazine (purified): (2 chloro-4 ethylamino) –6 (isopropylamino) –5- triazine; 95%) purity was obtained from Rallis India Bombay, India (designated as At-P). Atrazine (formulated): 50 EC was obtained from Northern Minerals limited, Daultabad Road, Gurgaon, Haryanna, India (designated as At-F). DCMU [3-(3,4 – dichloro phenyl)-1, 1- dimethyl urea] of 98% purity was obtained from ICN pharmaceuticals, Inc. life Sciences group Plainview, N.Y.

Determination of growth, macromolecular contents, photosynthesis and heterocyst frequency of wild type and multiple herbicide resistant mutant of A. *variabilis under herbicide stress*—Impact of increasing concentrations $(0-100 \text{ mg L}^{-1})$ of herbicides atrazine and DCMU on the growth and survival of diazotrophic cyanobacterial isolates was determined in N₂-medium by monitoring variations in the concentrations of chlorophyll *a* pigments¹⁸ at regular intervals of 24 h as a parameter of growth. For all the experiments, exponentially growing cells (6 day old) were harvested by centrifugation $(5000 \times g, 5 \text{ min})$, washed thrice with sterilized double distilled water and dispensed equally in assay flasks. Cultures were incubated under photo-autotrophic growth conditions as described above. The cultures without addition of herbicides were taken as control.

The 50% inhibitory growth concentrations for the strains were determined by monitoring survivability of cells on plates containing graded concentrations of herbicides. The percentage survival of the strains was calculated by the following method:

 $\frac{\text{Number of colonies on the herbicide treated plates}}{\text{Number of colonies on the untreated control plates}} \times 100$

The concentration of the herbicide at which 50% of colonies survived as compared to untreated control culture was termed as IGC₅₀ and the concentration at which no colonies survived (complete lysis) were considered the lethal concentration. The experiment was repeated thrice and every time five sets of plates were taken for each herbicide concentration. The data were analyzed by using a statistical computer program by determining means and standard errors.

Macromolecular contents i.e. protein¹⁹, carotenoids²⁰ and phycobiliprotein²¹ was determined at regular intervals of 48 h of diazotrophic growth.

Heterocyst frequency of exponentially grown diazotrophic culture of both MHR and wild type strain was determined microscopically and is expressed in percentage as total number of heterocysts occurring/ 100 vegetative cells.

The photosynthetic O_2 evolution and dark O_2 uptake of both wild type and mutant strain was measured with Clark type Oxygen electrode (Hansatech, U.K.) as per Rao *et al.*²².

Statistical analysis—The results are expressed as mean \pm SE.

Results

Effect of graded concentration (0 -100 mg L⁻¹) of herbicides (Atrazine and DCMU) on growth and survival of wild type and multiple herbicide resistant mutant of *A. variabilis* was monitored by estimating chlorophyll *a* content up to 12 days at an interval of 24 h. The initial chlorophyll *a* concentration (μ gml⁻¹) recorded 0.19 and 0.17 in wild type and *Av* (MHR) was increased to 2.5 and 2.9, respectively at 10th day of growth in untreated control cultures whereas the cultures treated with graded concentration of herbicide could not record any substantial increase in chlorophyll *a* content except in cultures treated with 1.0 and 2.0 mg L⁻¹ of pure atrazine, 0.5 mg L⁻¹ of formulated atrazine and 0.05-0.2 mg L⁻¹ of DCMU during their growth. On the basis of survival potentiality of wild type and MHR

Table 1—Lethal, sub-lethal and IGC₅₀ values (mg L^{-1}) of herbicides for wild type and MHR strain of *A. variabilis*. [Values are mean ± SE of 3 independent experiments]

Herbicides	Lethal		Sub-lethal		IGC ₅₀	
	Wild type	MHR	Wild type	MHR	Wild type	MHR
Atrazine (P)	8.0±0.25	8.0±0.35	6.0±0.22	6.0±0.46	1.9±0.33	1.8±0.24
Atrazine (F)	4.0±0.31	4.0±0.18	2.0±0.19	2.0±0.45	1.7±0.24	1.4±0.19
DCMU	0.6±0.15	0.5±0.23	0.5±0.45	0.4±0.17	0.08±0.20	0.03±0.36

under graded herbicide concentrations, the lethal, sublethal and IGC_{50} concentrations of herbicides were determined (Table 1).

Complete lysis of the cultures occurred at 8 mg L^{-1} of purified atrazine; 4 mg L⁻¹ of formulated atrazine in wild type and MHR; 0.6 mg L^{-1} (Wild type), 0.5 mg L⁻¹ (MHR) of DCMU between 6-10 days of incubation. Maximum inhibition in chlorophyll a content of 74 - 80% in wild type and 68 - 77% of control in MHR was observed at sublethal dosages of atrazine pure, formulated and DCMU treated cells at 8th day of growth (Fig. 1 a). As compared to untreated control cultures, at sublethal dosages of herbicides PC was reduced to 73-79%, PE to 72-79%, protein to 45-54%, carotenoid to 46-58%, heterocysts to 74-78% (Fig. 1 b) in wild type and in MHR strain PC was reduced to 61-67%, PE to 66-71%, protein to 47- 52%, carotenoid to 40-47%, heterocysts to 73% (Fig. 1 b) at 8^{th} day of growth. Photosynthetic O₂ evolution was suppressed to 83-87% in wild type and 80-85% in MHR (Fig. 1 c) whereas 65-74% suppression in wild type and 60-69% in MHR strain was observed in dark O₂ uptake (Fig. 1 d) at sublethal dosages as compared to untreated control cultures at 8th day of growth.

Discussion

The present results indicate gradual but substantial inhibition in growth with increasing concentration of herbicides. Both parent and mutant tolerated atrazine (purified) upto 4 mg L^{-1} and atrazine (formulated) upto 1 mg L⁻¹ and complete lysis was observed in 8 and 4 mg L^{-1} indicating atrazine (formulated) to be more toxic as compared to the purified form. Almost similar growth inhibitory concentration (Atrazine formulated) of 2 mg L^{-1} was reported in *Anabaena* flosaquae²³ 5 mg L^{-1} in *Nostoc* sp.²⁴. However, higher level of tolerance up to 10 mg L^{-1} was observed in Nostoc muscorum and Anabaena variabilis²⁵. On the contrary, a cyanobacterial strain SG2 tolerated markedly higher concentration of atrazine (purified) i.e. upto 1000 mg L^{-1} and the herbicide only marginally affected photosynthetic ability (10% of control) and had no effect on growth rate. However, 89% inhibition in O₂ evolution was exhibited by Synechocystis sp. Strain 6803 at 1000 mg L⁻¹ of atrazine²⁶. This is in contrast to results of Narusaka et al.²⁷ using several herbicide resistant mutants of Synechocystis sp. Strain PCC 6803, which grew slower under photosynthetic growth conditions and evolved 70% less O₂ than control strain grown under herbicide free conditions.



Fig. 1— Effect of sublethal dosages of herbicides on (a) chlorophyll *a* content, (b) heterocyst frequency, (c) photosynthetic O_2 evolution and (d) dark O_2 uptake of wild type (stripped) and MHR (dotted) strain of *A. variabilis*. [Values are mean ± SE of 3 independent experiments].

In the present study DCMU was found to be more growth toxic as compared to atrazine to both parent and mutant strain. Concentration of 0.6 and 0.5 mg L⁻¹ was growth inhibitory to parent and MHR strain. Almost similar growth inhibitory concentration of 0.2 mg L⁻¹ was reported in *Nostoc muscorum*¹³. However, a cyanobacterial strain SG2 tolerated DCMU upto 15 mg L⁻¹ but oxygen evolution was inhibited 75% at 5 mg L⁻¹ as reported by Sajjaphan *et al.*²⁶.

Herbicide treated wild type and MHR showed higher inhibition (as compared to untreated control) in photosynthetic O₂ evolution (83-87% in wild type and 80-85% in MHR) followed by chlorophyll a content (74-80 % in wild type and 68-77 % in MHR). The soluble pigments phycocyanin water and phycoerythrin followed almost similar trend of inhibition as chlorophyll a. Similarly heterocysts the site of nitrogen fixation showed marked suppression (74-78% inhibition in parent and 73% inhibition in mutant) under herbicide stress. The results further indicated that as compared to chlorophyll a and phycobiliproteins, carotenoid (46-58% in wild type and 40-47% in MHR) and protein content (45-54% in wild type and 47-52% in MHR) were less severely inhibited. Atrazine and DCMU are Triazine and phenylurea herbicides, which have been shown to inhibit photosystem II (PSII) in many plant species, algae and cyanobacteria. The structure and function of PSII in the cyanobacteria are similar to those found in higher plants²⁸, and PSII dependent electron transport in the cyanobacteria is similarly inhibited by these herbicides²⁹. The photosynthetic apparatus in cyanobacteria consists of thylakoid membrane bound protein assemblies composed of a number of polypeptide components, including the 32-kDa D_1 polypeptide³⁰ encoded by the *psb* A gene. The D_1 protein is a subunit of the PSII core complex³¹, and this protein also known as the Q_B binding protein, is the main target for phenylurea, triazine and phenolic group herbicides^{32,33}. These herbicides compete with plastoquinone for binding and inhibit photosynthesis by blocking electron transfer from quinone acceptors QA to $QB^{34,35}$. This inhibition is caused due to the primary effect of these herbicides at the photosynthetic level, which then leads to several secondary effects. The depletion of pigments seems to result from photoxidation induced by the inability of chlorophyll to dissipate its absorbed excitation energy due to inhibition of electron transport. This inhibition

limits the availability of NADPH³⁶. Since energy and reducing potential provided by NADPH play a vital role in many biosynthetic pathways, the changes in other parameters are also expected.

Heterocyst development depends upon the algal growth, herbicide concentrations inhibiting growth; also inhibit heterocyst formation³⁷. The results further indicated similar level of tolerance in the parent and MHR strain to the growth toxic effects of the two herbicides tested. The tolerance level of both parent and MHR strain was more in case of atrazine (< 6.0 mg L⁻¹ purified and < 2.0 mg L⁻¹ formulated) than DCMU (< 0.4 mg L^{-1}). Though both are photosynthetic inhibitor herbicides results from the analysis of D₁ mutants of several cyanobacteria and Chlamydomonas strains indicated that there is not a direct correspondence between atrazine resistance and resistance to DCMU. Moreover, this relationship differs considerably among mutations in the psb A genes from different species of cyanoabcteria ^{32,38,39,33}.

The results of the previous studies made with the survival potentialities of parent A. variabilis under graded concentration of Arozin, Alachlor, Butachlor and 2,4-D indicated that the isolate tolerated upto 15 mg L^{-1} of the herbicides and complete lysis was observed at 25 mg L⁻¹. Thus this indicates that as compared to Arozin, Alachlor, Butachlor and 2,4-D the two photosynthetic inhibitor herbicides tested were more growth toxic. This variation in the relative sensitivity of the strain to the growth toxic effects of the herbicides tested under laboratory conditions seems to result from interactions between mode of herbicidal actions with morphological, physiological, biochemical and genetic properties of cyanobacteria. Herbicides have differential effects on various metabolic processes and the sensitivity of the strain varies depending upon the species, kind of herbicides and chemical formulations 40-42. Thus. further incorporating resistant markers of these two herbicides by spontaneous mutational techniques can increase the herbicide tolerance potentiality of the strain. Therefore, construction of such novel multiple herbicide resistant strain with herbicide resistant metabolic activities are bound to serve as a potent biofertilizer inoculant in rice-agriculture applied with common rice field herbicides.

Acknowledgement

Thanks are due to DST New Delhi for financial assistance.

References

- 1 Day P R, Crop improvement, Constraints and challenges. *in British crop protection on weeds*, BCPC Pub Survey (U.K), (1987) 3.
- 2 Hill I R & Wright S J L, The behaviour and fate of pesticides in microbial environment. *in* Pesticide microbiology (Academic Press, London) 1998.
- 3 Singh H N & Vaishampayanm A, Biological effects of rice field herbicides machete on various strains of the nitrogen fixing blue green alga *Nostoc muscorum*, *Environ Exp Bot*, 18 (1978) 87.
- 4 Irisarri P, Gonnet S & Monza J, Cyanobacteria in Uruguayan rice fields: Diversity, nitrogen fixing ability and tolerance to herbicides and combined nitrogen, *J Biotechnol*, 91 (2001) 95.
- 5 Singh S, Datta P & Patel R, Survival and growth of diazotrophic Cyanobacterial isolates exposed to rice field herbicides, *Bull Environ Contam Toxicol*, 70 (2003) 1052.
- 6 Singh S & Datta P, Screening and selection of most potent diazotrophic cyanobacterial isolates exhibiting natural tolerance to rice field herbicides for exploition as biofertilizer, *J Basic Microbiol*, 46 (2006) 219.
- 7 Fay P, The blue greens (Cyanophyta Cyanobacteria), (Arnold-Heinemann, London) 1983.
- 8 De P K, The role of blue-green algae in nitrogen fixation in rice fields, *Proc Roy Soc London B*, 127 (1939) 121.
- 9 Venkataraman G S, Algalization, *Phykos*, 5 (1968) 64.
- 10 Stewart W D P, Rowell P, Kerby N W, Reed R H & Machray G C, N₂-fixing cyanobacteria and their potential application (*Phil Trans R Soc* London) 317 (1987) 245
- 11 Piletska E V, Piletska S A & Rouillon R, Application of chloroplast D1 protein in biosensors for monitoring photosystem–II inhibiting herbicide. *in Biotechnological applications of photosynthetic Proteins: Biochips, biosensors and biodevices, edited by* M T Giardi & E V Piletska (Landes Bioscience/Eurekah com), (*Texas and Springer,* New York) 2006, 37.
- 12 Singh L J, Tiwari D N & Singh H N, Evidence for genetic control of herbicide resistance in a rice field isolate of *Gloeocapsa* sp. capable of aerobic diazotrophy under photo autotrophic conditions, J Gen Appl Microbiol, 32 (1986) 81.
- 13 Modi D R, Singh A K, Rao K S, Chakravarty D & Singh H N, Construction of multiple herbicide resistant ammonia excreting strains of cyanobacterium *Nostoc musroum*, *Biotech Lett*, 13 (1991) 793.
- 14 Vaishampayan A & Hemantarajan A, Physiological responses of genetically improved nitrogen fixing cyanobacteria to agro-chemicalization in relation to paddy culture: prospects as a source material for engineering herbicide sensitivity and resistance in plants, *Adv Plant Physiol*, 1 (1998) 191.
- 15 Singh S, Datta P & Patel R, Cyanobacterial flora and properties of rice field soils of Jabalpur and Katni districts of Madhya Pradesh, *Phykos*, 39 (2000) 135.
- 16 Singh S & Datta P, Outdoor evaluation of various herbicide resistant strains of *Anabaena variabilis* as biofertilizer for rice plants, *Plant and Soil*, 296 (2007) 95.
- 17 Rippka R, Dereulles J, Waterbury J B, Herdman M & Stanier R V, Generic assignments, Strain histories and properties of pure cultures of cyanobacteria, *J Gen Microbiol*, 111 (1979) 1.
- 18 Mackinney G, Absorption of light by chlorophyll solutions, J Biol Chem, 140 (1941) 315.

- 19 Lowry O H, Rosenbrough N J, Farr A L, & Randall R J, Protein measuring with Folin Phenol reagent, *J Biol Chem*, 193 (1951) 265.
- 20 Weber A & Wetten M, Some remarks on the usefulness of algal carotenoids as chemotaxic markers, in Pigments in plants, edited by F.C. Cygzan, (Academic Press Verlag, Berlin) 1981, 104.
- 21 Benett A & Bogorad L, Complementary chromatic adaptation in a filamentous blue green algae, *J Cell Biol*, 58 (1973) 419.
- 22 Rao V V, Rai A N & Singh H N, Metabolic activities of akinetes of the cyanobacterium *Anabaena doliolum*: Oxygenic exchanges, photosynthetic pigments and enzymes of nitrogen metabolism, *J Gen Microbiol*, 130 (1984) 1299
- 23 Abou- Waly H, Abou-Setta M M, Nigg, H N & Mallory L L, Growth response of fresh water algae, *Anabaena flos-aquae* and *Selenastrum capricornutum* to Atrazin and Hexazinone herbicide, *Bull Environ Contam Toxicol*, 46 (1991) 223.
- 24 Sreenivas S & Rana B C, Growth and Metabolic response of Nostoc to Atrazine, Environment and Ecology, 12 (1994) 214.
- 25 Pandher M S, Gurmehar K, Gosal S K, Gupta R P & Kaur G, Effect of herbicides on the growth and nitrogen fixation by blue green algae, *Res Develop Rep*, 11 (1994) 3.
- 26 Sajjaphan K, Shapir N, Judd A K, Wackett L P & Sadowsky M J, Noval *psb A1* gene from a naturally occurring atrazine – resistant cyanobacterial isolate, *Appl Environ Microbiol*, 68 (2002) 1358.
- 27 Narusaka Y, Narusaka M, Kobayashi H & Satoh K, The herbicide–resistant species of the cyanobacterial D₁ protein obtained by thorough and random *in vitro* mutagenesis, *Plant Cell Physiol*, 39 (1998) 620.
- 28 Ho K K & Krogmann D W, Photosynthesis. in *The biology of cyanobacteria*, edited by N G Carr & B A Whitton. (University of California Press, Berkeley, California) 1982, 191.
- 29 Golden S S & Sherman L A, Biochemical and biophysical characterization of herbicide–resistant mutants of the unicellular cyanobacterium, *Anacystis nidulans* R2, *Biochem Biophys Acta*, 764 (1984) 239.
- 30 Mathis P, Primary reactions of photosynthesis: Discussion of current issues. *in* Progress in photosynthesis research, edited by J Biggins (Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands) 1987, 151
- 31 Satoh K, Nakatani H Y, Steinback K E, Watson J & Arntzen C J, Polypeptide composition of a photosystem II care complex presence of a herbicide–binding protein, *Biochem Biophys Acta*, 724 (1983) 142.
- 32 Ajlani G, Kirilovsky D, Picaud M & Astier C, Molecular analysis of psbA mutations responsible for various herbicide resistance phenotypes in *Synechocystis* 6714, *Plant Mol Biol*, 13 (1989) 469.
- 33 Ohad N & Hirschberg J, A similar structure of the herbicide binding in photosystem II of plants and cyanobacteria is demonstrated by site specific mutagenesis of the *psb A* gene, *Photosynth Res*, 23 (1990) 73
- 34 Tischer W & Strotmann H, Relationship between inhibitor binding by chloroplasts and inhibition of photosynthetic electron transport, *Biochem Biophys Acta*, 460 (1977) 113.
- 35 Wraight C A, Oxidation reduction Physical chemistry the acceptor quinone complex in bacterial photosynthesis reaction centers: evidence for a new model of herbicide activity, *Israel J Chem*, 21 (1981) 348.
- 36 Moreland D E, Mechanisms of action of herbicides, *Ann Rev Plant Physiol*, 31 (1980) 597.

- 37 Ahluwalia A S & Dhaiya S, Toxicity of a carbamate pesticide in a nitrogen fixing alga *Nostoc muscorum*, in Environment and Development, edited by I S Grover and A K Thukral (Thukral Scientific Publication, Jodhpur India) 1998, 119
- 38 Dalla-chiesa M, Friso G, Deak Z, Vars I, Barber J & Nixon P J, Reduced turnover of the D₁ polypeptide and photoactivation of electron transfer in novel herbicide resistant mutants of *Synechocystis* sp. PCC 6803, *Eur J Biochem*, 248 (1997) 731
- 39 Gingrich J C, Buzby J S, Stirewalt V L, & Bryant D A, Genetic analysis of two new mutations resulting in herbicide

resistance in the Cyanobacterium *Synechococcus* sp. PCC 7002, *Photosynth Res*, 16 (1988) 83.

- 40 Powell H A, Kerby N W & Powell P, Natural tolerance of cyanobacteria to the herbicide glyphosate, *New Phyto*, 119 (1991) 421
- 41 Anand N & Subramanian T D, Effect of certain pesticides on the physiology of *Nostoc calcicola, Phykos*, 36 (1997).
- 42 Fairchild J F, Ruessler D S & Carlson A R, Comparative sensitivity of five species of macrophytes and six species of algae to atrazine, metribuzin, alachlor and metachlor, *Environ Toxicol Chem*, 17 (1998) 1830.